LEGISLATIVE SUMMARY SHEET
Tracking No. O153-20

DATE: July 8, 2020

TITLE OF RESOLUTION: AN ACTION RELATING TO BUDGET AND FINANCE, LAW AND ORDER AND NAABIK'ÍYÁTI' COMMITTEES AND NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL; AMENDING 2 N.N.C. § 164 (A) (17) TO INCLUDE THE BUDGET LINEITEM VETO AUTHORITY LANGUAGE APPROVED BY NAVAJO VOTERS THROUGH INITIATIVE ELECTION IN 2009

PURPOSE: This resolution, if approved, will delegate amend 2 N.N.C. § 164 (A)(17)'s line-item veto language to match the ballot language approved by Navajo voters in the 2009 initiative.

This written summary does not address recommended amendments as may be provided by the standing committee. The Office of Legislative Counsel requests each committee member to review the proposed resolution in detail.
$\qquad$
$\qquad$ $07-14-20$

PROPOSED NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL RESOLUTION Naabik'íyáti' Committee 24th NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL -- Second Year, 2020



TRACKING NO. O153-20

## AN ACTION

RELATING TO BUDGET AND FINANCE, LAW AND ORDER AND
NAABIK'ÍYÁTI' COMMITTEES AND NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL;
AMENDING 2 N.N.C. § 164 (A) (17) TO INCLUDE THE BUDGET LINE-ITEM VETO AUTHORITY LANGUAGE APPROVED BY NAVAJO VOTERS THROUGH INITIATIVE ELECTION IN 2009

## BE IT ENACTED:

SECTION ONE. AUTHORITY
A. The Navajo Nation Council is the governing body of the Navajo Nation. 2 N.N.C. § 102 (A).
B. The Naabik'iyati' Committee is a standing committee of the Navajo Nation Council empowered to review all proposed legislation which requires final action by the Navajo Nation Council. 2 N.N.C. §164(A)(9).
C. The Law and Order Committee is a standing committee of the Navajo Nation Council empowered to review and make recommendations to the Navajo Nation Council on proposed amendments to and enactments to the Navajo Nation Code. 2 N.N.C. § 601 (B) (14).
D. The Budget and Finance Committee is a standing committee of the Navajo Nation Council empowered to review and make recommendations to the Navajo Nation Council on the budgeting, appropriation, investment, and management of all funds. 2 N.N.C. § 301 (B)(2).

## SECTION TWO. FINDINGS

A. Title One, Subchapter 2, of the Navajo Nation Code, titled Diné Bi Beehaz'áanii Bitsé Siléi--Declaration of the Foundation of Diné Law, affirms the traditional Diné teachings concerning the appropriate roles of each of the three branches of the Navajo Nation:

1. The leader(s) of the Executive Branch (Alְąaji' Hózhjí Naat'ááh) shall represent the Navajo Nation to other peoples and nations and implement the policies and laws (Diné bibeehaz'ánii) enacted by the legislative branch;
2. The leader(s) of the Legislative Branch (Aleáaji' Naat'ájí Naat'ááh and Alạají' Naat'áji Ndaanit'áii or Naat'aanii) shall enact policies and laws (Diné bibeehaz'áanii) in harmony with Diné bi beenahaz'áanii to address the immediate and future needs;
3. The leader(s) of the Judicial Branch (Aḷąaji' Hashkééji Naat'ááh) shall resolve disputes in the courts of the Navajo Nation and adopt rules of pleading, practice, procedure, and evidence by applying and interpreting Navajo Nation statutory laws and policies (Diné bibeehaz'áanii) enacted by the leaders of the Legislative Branch. The Peacemakers within the Peacemaking Program shall uphold the values and principles embodied in Diné bi beenahaz'áanii in the consensual practice of resolving disputes by peacemaking.
B. In 1989, the Navajo Tribal Council enacted Resolution No. CD-68-89 to reorganize the Navajo Nation government from a Chairmanship to a three Branch government; CD-68-89 recognized that the "[r]ecent controversy involving the leadership of the Navajo Nation has demonstrated that the present Navajo Nation Government
structure allows too much centralized power without real checks on the exercise of power. Experience shows that this deficiency in the government structure allows for, invites and has resulted in the abuse of power." CD-68-89, Whereas Clause No. 2.
C. CD-68-89 also specifically recognized that "it is in the best interest of the Navajo Nation that the Navajo Nation Government be reorganized to provide for separation of functions into three branches and provide for checks and balances between the three branches . . " CD-68-89, Whereas Clause No. 8.
D. In 2009, in response to the $21^{\text {st }}$ Navajo Nation Council's "over-appropriation" of Undesignated Unreserved General Funds (aka UUFB), the Navajo People, through an initiative vote action, delegated the President the authority to line-item veto budget items contained in the annual Navajo Nation Comprehensive Budget or supplemental appropriations approved by the Navajo Nation Council.
E. The ballot language, attached as Exhibit A, approved by the Navajo People on December 15, 2009 through an initiative election, became the law of the Navajo Nation; the 2009 ballot language specifically stated that
"The President of the Navajo Nation will be authorized to exercise line item veto authority over budget items contained in the annual Navajo Nation Comprehensive Budget or supplemental appropriations approved by the Navajo Nation Council. Budget line items vetoed by the President of the Navajo Nation will not be subject to Navajo Nation Council override. Upon approval of this initiative, the authority of the President of the Navajo Nation to exercise line item veto authority will become effective immediately." Exhibit A.
F. The 2009 ballot language further stated that "[i]f approved, this initiative may be repealed or amended by the initiative process only." Exhibit A.
G. The $22^{\text {nd }}$ Navajo Nation Council recognized the line-item veto law approved by the Navajo People by amending its own Title Two authorities to state that "[a]ll resolutions enacting new laws or amending existing laws are subject to veto by the President of the Navajo Nation pursuant to 2 N.N.C § 1005(C)(10) and (11)

## Page 3 of 5

and override by the Navajo Nation Council, except financial line-item vetoes are not subject to override." 2 N.N.C. § 164 (A) (17) [emphasis added].
H. The $22^{\text {nd }}$ Navajo Nation Council's amendment did not match the ballot language approved by the Navajo voters in 2009; this discrepancy has contributed to confusion and discord between the Executive and Legislative Branches related to the extent of the President's line-item veto authority, as well as the appropriate roles of each of the branches.
I. The Navajo Nation Council finds it in the best interest of the Navajo Nation government to fully recognize what was approved by the Navajo voters in the 2009 initiative by amending 2 N.N.C. § 164 (A) (17) to reflect the actual initiative ballot language, i.e., "[t]he President of the Navajo Nation will be authorized to exercise line item veto authority over budget items contained in the annual Navajo Nation Comprehensive Budget or supplemental appropriations approved by the Navajo Nation Council. Budget line items vetoed by the President of the Navajo Nation will not be subject to Navajo Nation Council override." Exhibit A.

## SECTION THREE. AMENDING 2 N.N.C. § 164 (A)(17)

The Navajo Nation Council hereby amends 2 N.N.C. § 164 (A) (17) as follows:

## § 164. Navajo Nation Council and Committee Legislative Process

A. Statements of policy, enactment of positive law, intergovernmental agreements, budget resolutions and reallocations, must be reviewed and approved by resolution by the appropriate standing committee(s) and the Navajo Nation Council except as otherwise provided herein.
17. All resolutions enacting new laws or amending existing laws are subject to veto by the President of the Navajo Nation pursuant to 2 N.N.C § 1005(C)(10) and (11) and override by the Navajo Nation Council, except financial line-item vetoes are not subject to override the President is authorized to exercise line item veto authority over budget items contained in
the annual Navajo Nation Comprehensive Budget or supplemental appropriations approved by the Navajo Nation Council; budget line items vetoed by the President will not be subject to Navajo Nation Council override. A vetoed resolution shall first be submitted to Naabik'íyáti' Committee before consideration by the Council. Memorials are not subject to veto but become effective upon certification by the Speaker pursuant to 2 N.N.C. $\S 221$ (C). All acts of the vetoing of the resolution shall occur within the territorial jurisdiction of the Navajo Nation as described in 7 N.N.C. § 254.
****

## SECTION FOUR. EFFECTIVE DATE

This action shall become effective upon its approval pursuant to 2 N.N.C. §§ 164 (A)(17) and 221 (B).

## SECTION FIVE. SAVING CLAUSE

Should any provision of this legislation be determined invalid by the Navajo Nation Supreme Court, or a District Court of the Navajo Nation without appeal to the Navajo Nation Supreme Court, those portions of the legislation which are not determined invalid shall remain the law of the Navajo Nation.
NOV-18-08 02:54pa Fros-KN LEGISLATIVE COUNSEL

 40121515412914


 following proposed
 Avc: .- To authariza tha Prosident of for Navaio Nation lo voto budael fine liems contalined in the annual


筑率
Exhllofi D


## Summary Information

> The budget flems vetoed pursuant to this authority will not be aubject to Navajo Nation Council override.
The people have delermined that the current govainmental structure lacks sufficient checks and balances between the Legielative and Executiva Branehes of government. This is evidenced by the Navajo Nation Council's excessive spending of public funds, its inability to maintain the Undesignated, Unreserved Fund Balance at an amount required by law, and ita conthuous walver of Navajo lawz.
The peopie have also detarmined that a need exiata to controt excesaive spending of the tribal treasury by the Navajo Nation Cauncil, and that the only way to do so la to authorize the Preeldent of the Navaja Nation to have line Item veto authority.
Through the initiative process, this baliot messure witl be placed on the November 2008 Chaptar Official General Election Ballol.
If approved, the power of the Presidenf of the Nasvajo Alation to exerciege line Item vato authority will become effective Immediately.


## MEMORANDUM

To : Hon. Daniel E. Tso, Delegate Navajo Nation Council

From


Date : July 8, 2020
Re : AN ACTION RELATING TO BUDGET AND FINANCE, LAW AND ORDER AND NAABIK'IYÁTI' COMMITTEES AND NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL; AMENDING 2 N.N.C. § 164 (A) (17) TO INCLUDE THE BUDGET LINE-ITEM VETO AUTHORITY LANGUAGE APPROVED BY NAVAJO VOTERS THROUGH INITIATIVE ELECTION IN 2009

As requested, I have prepared the above-referenced proposed resolution and associated legislative summary sheet pursuant to your request for legislative drafting. As to format, the resolution as drafted is legally sufficient. Regarding substance, as with any legislation, it can be subject to review by the courts in the event of proper challenge. Please ensure that this particular resolution request is precisely what you want.

If you are satisfied with the proposed resolution, please sign it as "sponsor" and submit it to the Office of Legislative Services where it will be given a tracking number and sent to the Office of the Speaker for assignment. If the proposed resolution is unacceptable to you. please contact me at the Office of Legislative Counsel and advise me of the changes you would like made to the proposed resolution. Ahéhee'.

THE NAVAJO NATION
LEGISLATIVE BRANCH

LEGISLATION NO: _0153-20 $\qquad$ SPONSOR: Daniel Tso

TITLE: An Action Relating to Budget and Finance, Law and Order and Naabik'íyáti’ Committees and Navajo Nation Council; Amending 2 N.N.C. $\$ 164$ (A) (17) to Include the Budget Line-Item Veto Authority Language Approved by Navajo Voters Through Initiative Election in 2009

Date posted: July 8, 2020 at 5:53PM

## Digital comments may be e-mailed to comments@navajo-nsn.gov

Written comments may be mailed to:

Executive Director<br>Office of Legislative Services<br>P.O. Box 3390<br>Window Rock, AZ 86515<br>(928) 871-7586

Comments may be made in the form of chapter resolutions, letters, position papers, etc. Please include your name, position title, address for written comments; a valid e-mail address is required. Anonymous comments will not be included in the Legislation packet.

Please note: This digital copy is being provided for the benefit of the Navajo Nation chapters and public use. Any political use is prohibited. All written comments received become the property of the Navajo Nation and will be forwarded to the assigned Navajo Nation Council standing committee(s) and/or the Navajo Nation Council for review. Any tampering with public records are punishable by Navajo Nation law pursuant to 17 N.N.C. $\$ 374$ et. seq.

## THE NAVAJO NATION <br> LEGISLATIVE BRANCH <br> INTERNET PUBLIC REVIEW SUMMARY

LEGISLATION NO.: 0153-20
SPONSOR: Honorable Daniel E. Ts

Title: An Action Relating To Budget And Finance, Law And Order And NAABIK'IYATI' Committees And Navajo Nation Council; Amending 2 N.N.C. $\S 164$ (A) (17) To Include The Budget Line-Item Veto Authority Language Approved by Navajo Voters Through Initiative Election In 2009

Posted: July 8, 2020 at 5:53 PM
5 DAY Comment Period Ended: July 13, 2020
Digital Comments received:

| Comments Supporting | 1) Commission on Navajo Government Development |
| :--- | :--- |
| Comments Opposing | 1) Martha Tate |
| Inconclusive Comments | None |

ofohuson
Legislative Tracking Secretary Office of Legislative Services $07 / 14 / 20 \quad 8: 17 \mathrm{Am}$

Date/Time

## RESOLUTION OF THE COMMISSION ON NAVAJO GOVERNMENT DEVELOPMENT

AN ACTION TO SUPPORT NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL LEGISLATION 0153-20: AN ACTION RELATING TO BUDGET AND FINANCE, LAW AND ORDER AND NAABIK'ÍYÁTI' COMMITTEE AND NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL; AMENDING 2 N.N.C. \$164 (A)(17) TO INCLUDE THE BUDGET LINE-ITEM VETO AUTHORITY LANGUAGE APPROVED BY NAVAJO VOTERS THROUGH INTTIATIVE ELECTION IN 2009

## WHEREAS:

1. Pursuant to CD-68-89, the Navajo Nation Council established the Commission on Navajo Government Development ("Commission") including the Office of Navajo Government Development (ONGD) with quasi-independent authority to accomplish the Navajo Nation Council's project of instituting reforms necessary to ensure an accountable and responsible government; and
2. Pursuant to 2 N.N.C. $\S 973(B)(2)$, the Commission shall have the power "to provide short and long-range comprehensive planning, evaluation and development appropriate to further enhance a Navajo Government that will perpetually accommodate the Navajo People both at the central government level and at the local level by providing for their involvement, promote their general welfare, ensure government accountability, integrity, justice, domestic order, and retain traditional harmony, cultural respect, heritage, and the protection of personal liberties."; and
3. On December 15,2009 , the Navajo People voted to approve an initiative that empowered the Navajo Nation President with line-item veto authority where the ballot explicitly stated, "The President of the Navajo Nation will be authorized to exercise line-item veto authority over budget items contained in the annual Navajo Nation Comprehensive Budget or supplemental appropriations approved by the Navajo Nation Council..."; and
4. The newly granted line-item veto power was ultimately codified in 2 N.N.C 164 (A)(17) and it reads, "All resolutions enacting new laws or amending existing laws are subject to veto by the President of the Navajo Nation pursuant to 2 N.N.C § 1005(C)(10) and (11) and override by the Navajo Nation Council, except financial line-item vetoes are not subject to override..."; and
5. The "financial line-item vetoes" language of 2 N.N.C 164 (A)(17) is not a correct reflection of the "authority over budget items contained in the annual Navajo Nation Comprehensive Budget or supplemental appropriations approved by the Navajo Nation Council" language on the original ballot approved by the Navajo People; and
6. The Commission recognizes the political doctrine of the separation of powers and under this framework, there is an interplay of power among the three branches. Each branch has its own authority, but also must depend on the authority of the other branches for the government to function. History in most Western democracies has time and again shown
that unlimited power in the hands of one person or group in most cases means that others are suppressed or their powers curtailed. The separation of powers in a democracy is to prevent abuse of power and to safeguard freedom for all; and
7. The Commission has determined that the inconsistencies between the original ballot language describing the Navajo Nation President's line-item veto power and the power as codified in 2 N.N.C $164(\mathrm{~A})(17)$ have led to inappropriate and misapplication of the lineitem veto authority and the expansion of the power beyond what the Navajo People intended in 2009; and
8. The Commission acknowledges the 1989 reform as a provisional calling toward a more structured government by permitting the system of separation of powers that divides the tasks of the Navajo Nation into three branches: legislative, executive, and judicial. These tasks are assigned to different institutions in such a way that each of them can check the others. As a result, no one institution can become so powerful in a democracy as to destroy this system; and
9. The Commission supports the effort to clarify the Navajo Nation's line-item veto power as codified in 2 N.N.C 164 (A)(17) in order to protect the Navajo People's general welfare, ensure government accountability, integrity, justice, domestic order, and retain traditional harmony, cultural respect, heritage, and protection of personal liberties.

## NOW THEREFORE IT BE RESOLVED THAT:

1. The Commission on Navajo Government Development hereby supports the Navajo Nation Council Legislation 0153-20: An action relating to Budget and Finance, Law and Order and Naabik' 'iyáti' Committee and Navajo Nation Council; amending 2 N.N.C. §164(A)(17) to include the budget line-item veto authority language approved by Navajo voters through an initiative election in 2009.

## CERTIFICATION

I, hereby certify that the foregoing resolution was duly considered by the Commission on Navajo Government Development at a duly meeting (via teleconference) in Window Rock, Navajo Nation (Arizona) at which a quorum was present and that same was passed by a vote of $\underline{8}$ in favor, $\underline{0}$ opposed, and 1 abstained, this $13^{\text {th }}$ day of July 2020.


Motion: $\qquad$ Kenneth Maryboy

Second: $\qquad$

P.O. Box 220, Window Rock, Arizona 86515 |PHONE: (928) 871-7214 | FAX: (928) 871-7162

## IMMEDIATE RELEASE:

July 13, 2020

## THE COMMISSION ON NAVAJO GOVERNMENT DEVELOPMENT SUPPORTS LEGISLATION NO. 0153-20

Window Rock, Navajo Nation (ARIZ) - The Commission on Navajo Government Development unanimously passed Resolution No. CNGD-0701-20: AN ACTION TO SUPPORT NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL LEGISLATION 0153-20: AN ACTION RELATING TO BUDGET AND FINANCE, LAW AND ORDER AND NAABIK'ÍYÁTI' COMMITTEE AND NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL; AMENDING 2 N.N.C. $\S 164$ (A)(17) TO INCLUDE THE BUDGET LINE-ITEM VETO AUTHORITY LANGUAGE APPROVED BY NAVAJO VOTERS THROUGH INITIATIVE ELECTION IN 2009

- The Commission on Navajo Government Development supports Hon. Delegate Daniel Tso's legislation to clarify the Navajo Nation President's line item veto authority.
- The Commission has found that the line-item veto authority of the Navajo Nation President is inconsistent with the original referendum initiative and needs to be clarified to prevent inappropriate exercises of the line-item veto authority.

The Commission on Navajo Government Development has determined that the line-item veto authority granted to the Navajo Nation President in 2009 through a referendum vote needs to be further clarified. The original language describing the line-item veto authority in 2009 was not what was ultimately codified in the Navajo Nation Code. Therefore, the Commission on Navajo Government Development fully Supports Hon. Delegate Daniel Tso's Legislation seeking to correct the line-item veto language in the Navajo Nation Code.

The original ballot language of 2009 stated that, "The President of the Navajo Nation will be authorized to exercise line item veto authority over budget items contained in the annual Navajo Nation Comprehensive Budget or supplemental appropriations approved by the Navajo Nation Council..." However, the language that was later codified reads, "All resolutions enacting new laws or amending existing laws are subject to veto by the President of the Navajo Nation pursuant to 2 N.N.C § 1005 (C)(10) and (11) and override by the Navajo Nation Council, except financial line-item vetoes are not subject to override..." The language that was codified is not a true reflection of the original ballot language and creates ambiguity.

This ambiguity has resulted in the misuse of the line-item veto power by administrations since 2009. Past Navajo Nation presidents have mistakenly exercised the line item-veto authority in ways that went beyond the approval of amounts in the Navajo Nation Comprehensive Budget or supplemental appropriations approved by the Navajo Nation Council.

The Commission on Navajo Government Development is an entity that was created in 1989 to develop government reform and policy recommendations to the Navajo Nation Council and supports legislation No. 0153-20 on behalf of the Navajo People. The commission represent many aspects of life on the Navajo Nation including Chapter Officials, Navajo Students, Navajo Nation Government Branches, Women's Commission, and Traditional Practitioners.

## Legislation 0153-20


#### Abstract

Martha Tate [martha.tate1835@gmail.com](mailto:martha.tate1835@gmail.com) Fri 7/10/2020 11:57 PM

To:comments [comments@navajo-nsn.gov](mailto:comments@navajo-nsn.gov); CcJonathan Nez [jonathannez@navajo-nsn.gov](mailto:jonathannez@navajo-nsn.gov); Herman Daniels, Jr. [hdaniels@navajo-nsn.gov](mailto:hdaniels@navajo-nsn.gov); Paul Begay [paulbegay@navajonsn.gov](mailto:paulbegay@navajonsn.gov); Nathaniel Brown [nbrown@navajo-nsn.gov](mailto:nbrown@navajo-nsn.gov); Otto Tso [otso@navajo-nsn.gov](mailto:otso@navajo-nsn.gov); Thomas Walker Jr. [thomaswalkerjr@navajo-nsn.gov](mailto:thomaswalkerjr@navajo-nsn.gov); Hank Stevens [nmwua@hotmail.com](mailto:nmwua@hotmail.com); Jerry Williams [jerry.williams380@icloud.com](mailto:jerry.williams380@icloud.com); Sarah Slim [howelmesa@outlook.com](mailto:howelmesa@outlook.com); Elizabeth Whitethorne-Benally [ewbenally@navajochapters.org](mailto:ewbenally@navajochapters.org); james adakai [fasthorse.adakai@gmail.com](mailto:fasthorse.adakai@gmail.com); Sharon Jean NMtn [jeanshar_57@hotmail.com](mailto:jeanshar_57@hotmail.com); Jordan Etcitty [jordan.e@dbosba.org](mailto:jordan.e@dbosba.org); fayeblueeyes13@gmail.com [fayeblueeyes13@gmail.com](mailto:fayeblueeyes13@gmail.com); rezmom2@gmail.com [rezmom2@gmail.com](mailto:rezmom2@gmail.com); Krista ALLEN [kallen@navajotimes.com](mailto:kallen@navajotimes.com);


The Legislation 0153-20 is set to sway the NAVAJO people to take away the approved veto power of the Office of the NAVAJO Nation President.
I strongly oppose the passage of this legislation as it only benefits the Navajo Nation Council and the Speaker of the Council. The checks and balances between the 3 branches will be severely jeopardized with this legislation if it is approved by the 24 th NN Council.
The Navajo Nation Council and the Speaker already have too much power as it has the standing committee over the Judicial Branch. The Navajo Nation Council also has full authority over the Navajo Nation judges, per their review of their job performances and tenure.
Just look at the decision making power of the NN Council Standing Committees! HEHSC just approved the School Apportionment Plan that wasn't even supported in the Public Hearings nor from the school boards of the Grant Schools or BIE school boards. HEHSC just took away the power of decision making of the LOCAL SCHOOL BOARD! HEHSC did not make any attempt nor did they requested feedback from each P.L.100-397 operated school boards or from the 33 BIE operated school boards.
The only viable voice of the Navajo people to stop giving the Navajo Nation Council and the Speaker of the Council more power is the OPVP.
The Only true voice of the Navajo people right now is the Office of the President and the Vice President.
The parents of the BIE funded schools have lost confidence in the decision making of the NAVAJO Nation Council and it's standing committees.
Please stop using word play to confuse us, the NAVAJO People to gain more power over the Executive branch.
Ahe'hee for your time in reading my comments regarding Legislation 153-20 into the record.
Please abide by the true 3 branch government concept for the truest representation on behalf of the Navajo people.
Martha TAte
Ts'ah Bii Kin, AZ

Sent from my iPhone
WARNING: External email. Please verify sender before opening attachments or clicking on links.

